



DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE

AGENDA ITEM

AGENDA DATE: MARCH 2, 2016
TO: Chair Fox and Members of the Design Review Committee
THRU: Leslie Aranda Roseberry, Planning Manager
FROM: Marissa Moshier, Associate Planner – Historic Preservation
SUBJECT: **DRC NO. 4828-15 – THE PIE HOLE SIGNAGE**

SUMMARY

The applicant proposes to install one new blade sign, recover existing awnings, and paint the exterior of a restaurant at 177 N. Glassell Street in the Plaza Historic District.

RECOMMENDED ACTION – FINAL DETERMINATION

Staff recommends that the DRC approve the proposed project subject to conditions of approval contained in the staff report and any conditions that the DRC determines appropriate to support the required findings.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Applicant: Tiffany DelGatto, Western Sign and Awning
Owner: David A. Zirkle, Philip C. Zirkle, Raymond Wedaa, Jr., and Janice Lynne Wedaa
Property Location: 177 N. Glassell Street (Plaza Historic District)
General Plan Designation: Old Towne Mixed Use-15
Zoning Classification: Old Towne Mixed Use-15
Existing Development: 1,849 SF restaurant
Property Size: 2,114 SF
Associated Applications: None
Previous DRC Review: None

PUBLIC NOTICE

No Public Notice was required for this project.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Categorical Exemption: The proposed project is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines 15331 - Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation. The project is limited to minor exterior improvements to the existing building, in conformance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (Secretary's Standards)* and the Old Towne Design Standards. There is no environmental public review required for a Categorical Exemption.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The proposed project involves modifications to the exterior of the property as part of the tenant improvements for a new restaurant, The Pie Hole. The major project components include:

- Remove the existing projecting neon sign.
- Install a new projecting sign on the west elevation. The sign's aluminum cabinet is 46 inches by 46 inches with a sponge painted finish in "Pantone 417U" and "Pantone 276U." It includes white vinyl letters on the sign faces with white and purple neon. The sign will be installed in the same location as the removed projecting sign.
- Recover the existing awnings with new Sunbrella fabric in "Cassis #7554."
- Paint the wood elements of the storefront on the west elevation and the stucco on the north elevation. The proposed paint colors are Sherwin Williams "SW 7039 – Virtual Taupe" and "SW 6064 – Reticence." "Virtual Taupe" is already painted on the wood storefront elements of the existing building.

Detailed plans of the proposed changes, including sign information, are included as Attachment 5 to this report.

EXISTING SITE

The existing site is developed with a 1,849 SF commercial building at the intersection of North Glassell Street and Maple Avenue. The building was originally constructed c. 1912, and underwent a substantial restoration in 2008. It is a contributor to the National Register-listed Plaza Historic District.

EXISTING AREA CONTEXT

The subject property is located at the northern edge of the Plaza Historic District. It is surrounded by a mix of commercial uses with accessory residential uses in some buildings.

EVALUATION CRITERIA

Orange Municipal Code (OMC) Section 17.10.070 establishes the general criteria the DRC should use when reviewing the project. This section states the following:

The project shall have an internally consistent, integrated design theme, which is reflected in the following elements:

1. **Architectural Features.**
 - a. The architectural features shall reflect a similar design style or period.
 - b. Creative building elements and identifying features should be used to create a high quality project with visual interest and an architectural style.
2. **Landscape.**
 - a. The type, size and location of landscape materials shall support the project's overall design concept.
 - b. Landscaping shall not obstruct visibility of required addressing, nor shall it obstruct the vision of motorists or pedestrians in proximity to the site.
 - c. Landscape areas shall be provided in and around parking lots to break up the appearance of large expanses of hardscape.
3. **Signage.** All signage shall be compatible with the building(s) design, scale, colors, materials and lighting.
4. **Secondary Functional and Accessory Features.** Trash receptacles, storage and loading areas, transformers and mechanical equipment shall be screened in a manner, which is architecturally compatible with the principal building(s).

ANALYSIS/STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

Issue 1: Installation of Blade Sign

The proposed projecting sign meets the signage requirements of the Orange Municipal Code and the Old Towne Design Standards. However, installation of the sign may impact the historic painted sign on the building's west elevation. The exterior of the historic building was rehabilitated in 2008. The rehabilitation included removal of exterior stucco, which uncovered a historic painted sign above the storefronts. The painted sign is a historic feature of the building and must be preserved under the requirements of the Old Towne Design Standards. In order to protect the painted sign, the new blade sign will be installed in the same location as the removed sign. Staff has included the following condition of approval to protect the painted sign:

The historic painted sign shall be protected in place during installation of the projecting sign. The attachments for the new projecting sign shall be in the same location and the

same size as the attachments for the existing sign. Should the painted sign be damaged during installation, the applicant shall repair the sign to the satisfaction of the Community Development Director, prior to final of the building permit.

With the condition of approval, staff recommends that the historic painted sign will be adequately protected during installation of the new projecting sign and that the proposed project is in conformance with the *Secretary's Standards* and the Old Towne Design Standards.

ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

None.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRED FINDINGS

The courts define a "Finding" as a conclusion which describes the method of analysis decision makers utilize to make the final decision. A decision making body "makes a Finding," or draws a conclusion, through identifying evidence in the record (i.e., testimony, reports, environmental documents, etc.) and should not contain unsupported statements. The statements which support the Findings bridge the gap between the raw data and the ultimate decision, thereby showing the rational decision making process that took place. The "Findings" are, in essence, the ultimate conclusions which must be reached in order to approve (or recommend approval of) a project. The same holds true if denying a project; the decision making body must detail why it cannot make the Findings.

The Findings are applied as appropriate to each project. Based on the following Findings and statements in support of such Findings, staff recommends the DRC approve the project with recommended conditions.

1. *In the Old Towne Historic District, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the DRC or other reviewing body for the project (OMC 17.10.070.G.1).*

The proposed project conforms with the Old Towne Design Standards for the Plaza Historic District. The size and type of signage proposed meets the requirements set forth in the Design Standards and Orange Municipal Code. With the condition of approval protecting the historic painted sign during installation of the new signage, the project will not damage character-defining features of the historic building. The proposed recovering of the existing awnings is also in keeping with customary awning styles in the Plaza Historic District and is complementary to the architectural style of the building.

2. *In any National Register Historic District, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior's standards and guidelines (OMC 17.10.07.G.2).*

Projects found to be in conformance with the Old Towne Design Standards are generally considered to be in conformance with the *Secretary's Standards*. The project is in conformance with Standards 2, 5, and 9, in that the historic building's distinctive features will be retained and preserved, and alterations to the building will not remove or negatively alter any historic materials or features.

3. *The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards, and their required findings (OMC 17.10.07.G.3).*

With the conditions recommended by staff, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria set forth in the Old Towne Design Standards and Orange Municipal Code Section 17.36, as described above.

4. *For infill residential development, as specified in the City of Orange Infill Residential Design Guidelines, the new structure(s) or addition are compatible with the scale, massing, orientation, and articulation of the surrounding development and will preserve or enhance existing neighborhood character (OMC 17.10.07.G.4).*

As the *City of Orange Infill Residential Design Guidelines* do not apply to commercial projects, this finding does not apply.

RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS

The approval of this project is subject to the following conditions:

1. The historic painted sign shall be protected in place during installation of the projecting sign. The attachments for the new projecting sign shall be in the same location and the same size as the attachments for the existing sign. Should the painted sign be damaged during installation, the applicant shall repair the sign to the satisfaction of the Community Development Director, prior to final of the building permit.
2. This project is approved as a precise plan. All work shall conform in substance and be maintained in general conformance with plans and exhibits labeled as Attachments 4 and 5, including modifications required by the conditions of approval, and as recommended for approval by the Design Review Committee. Any changes from the approved plans shall be subject to subsequent review and approval by the Design Review Committee.
3. The applicant agrees to indemnify, hold harmless, and defend the City, its officers, agents and employees from any and all liability or claims that may be brought against the City arising out of its approval of this permit, save and except that caused by the City's active negligence.
4. Construction permits shall be obtained for all future construction work, as required by the City of Orange, Community Development Department's Building Division. Failure to obtain the required building permits will be cause for revocation of this permit.

5. If not utilized, project approval expires twenty-four months from the approval date. Extensions of time may be granted in accordance with OMC Section 17.08.060. The Planning entitlements expire unless Building Permits are pulled within 2 years of the original approval.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Vicinity Map
2. DPR Form 523 for 177 N. Glassell Street
3. Site Photographs
4. Color Board (Original to be provided at DRC meeting)
5. Proposed Sign and Paint Plans

cc: Western Sign and Awning
Attn: Tiffany DelGatto
261 S. Pacific Street
San Marcos, CA 92078

Pinhero Thomas Construction
Attn: Sunny Pinhero
39252 Winchester Rd.
Suite 107 #177
Murrieta CA 92563

David A. Zirkle
181 Bolla Ave
Alamo, CA 92507

Philip Carvel Zirkle
6914 E. Paragon
Orange, CA 92867

Janice Lynne and Raymond Wedaa
679 N. Markwood
Orange, CA 92867