



DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE

AGENDA ITEM

AGENDA DATE: JULY 6, 2016
TO: Chair Fox and Members of the Design Review Committee
THRU: Leslie Aranda Roseberry, Planning Manager
FROM: Marissa Moshier, Associate Planner – Historic Preservation
SUBJECT: DRC NO. 4779-14 – THE WALL RESTAURANT

SUMMARY

A proposal to install new signage and awnings for a new restaurant in the Plaza Historic District. The signage, awnings and lighting were previously approved by the DRC on November 18, 2015; however, the applicant is requesting approval of a new sign design and different color awnings. The restaurant also will have an outdoor dining area in the northeast quadrant of the Plaza, approved under Outdoor Dining Permit No. 06-15. Under the Outdoor Dining Ordinance, the Community Development Director has final approval of the outdoor dining furniture. Staff is seeking the DRC's recommendation on the compatibility of the outdoor dining furniture with the Plaza Historic District.

RECOMMENDED ACTION – FINAL DETERMINATION / RECOMMENDATION TO CDD

Staff recommends that the DRC approve the proposed project for new signage and awnings, subject to conditions of approval contained in the staff report and any conditions that the DRC determines appropriate to support the required findings. Staff recommends that the DRC provide recommendations to the Community Development Director on the outdoor dining furniture.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Applicant: PS80 Partners, LLC
Owner: Steven R. Smith
Property Location: 80 Plaza Square (Plaza Historic District)
General Plan Designation: Old Towne Mixed Use
Zoning Classification: OTMU-15 (Old Towne Mixed Use-15)
Existing Development: 1,708 SF tenant space in a 28,142 SF two-story commercial building (constructed c. 1905)
Property Size: 16,173 SF
Associated Applications: CUP 2967-14, Outdoor Dining Permit 06-15

Previous DRC Review: November 18, 2015

PUBLIC NOTICE

No Public Notice is required for this project.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Categorical Exemption: This project is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per State CEQA Guidelines Section 15303 (Class 3 – New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures) and 15331 (Class 31 – Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation), because the project consists of minor exterior alterations to an existing commercial structure to accommodate a new restaurant of 1,708 square feet. The proposed alterations are in conformance with the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*. There is no environmental public review required for a Categorical Exemption.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The proposed project involves modifications to the exterior of the property as part of the tenant improvements for a new restaurant, The Wall. The modifications to the exterior include:

- Install new signage on the south (front) elevation consisting of one wall sign and one hanging pedestrian sign. The wall sign is 8.4 square feet in area and has two lines of painted aluminum channel letters, consisting of the business’s “The Wall” logo and an additional line of text, plus a “W” logo. The hanging pedestrian sign consists of a two inch thick, painted aluminum sign hanging from an aluminum pole finished with a ball finial. The hanging sign area is 5.1 square feet in area per sign face.
- Install one new wall sign on the north elevation. The painted aluminum logo sign is nine square feet in area.
- All sign attachments will use stainless steel pins at the mortar joints in the historic masonry.
- Install new awnings on the south elevation. The applicant is proposing to cover the awnings with a blue Sunbrella fabric to match the existing.
- The applicant received approval for an outdoor dining area in the Plaza Dining Zone (pink paving area) in the public right of way. Prior to issuance of an Outdoor Dining Permit, the Community Development Director reviews and approves the proposed furniture for the outdoor dining area. Staff is seeking the DRC’s recommendation to the Community Development Director on the compatibility of the proposed furniture and fencing with the Plaza Historic District.

EXISTING SITE

The two-story commercial building was constructed c. 1905. Circa 1907, the building was expanded to the east by an additional three bays (including the storefronts currently addressed as 80 Plaza Square). Although the storefronts have been altered multiple times, the building retains sufficient

integrity of location, setting, design, materials, feeling and association to be considered a contributor to the National Register-listed Plaza Historic District.

EXISTING AREA CONTEXT

The subject property is located within the National Register-listed Plaza Historic District. The immediate area contains a mix of retail and restaurant uses with offices and apartments on the second floor of some buildings.

EVALUATION CRITERIA

Orange Municipal Code (OMC) Section 17.10.070 establishes the general criteria the DRC should use when reviewing the project. This section states the following:

The project shall have an internally consistent, integrated design theme, which is reflected in the following elements:

1. **Architectural Features.**
 - a. The architectural features shall reflect a similar design style or period.
 - b. Creative building elements and identifying features should be used to create a high quality project with visual interest and an architectural style.
2. **Landscape.**
 - a. The type, size and location of landscape materials shall support the project's overall design concept.
 - b. Landscaping shall not obstruct visibility of required addressing, nor shall it obstruct the vision of motorists or pedestrians in proximity to the site.
 - c. Landscape areas shall be provided in and around parking lots to break up the appearance of large expanses of hardscape.
3. **Signage.**
 - a. All signage shall be compatible with the building(s) design, scale, colors, materials and lighting.
4. **Secondary Functional and Accessory Features.** Trash receptacles, storage and loading areas, transformers and mechanical equipment shall be screened in a manner which is architecturally compatible with the principal building(s).

ANALYSIS/STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES

Issue 1 – Signage and Awnings

The DRC previously approved a wall sign and hanging sign on the front elevation and a wall sign on the rear elevation. Since that time, the applicant has changed the business logo and is requesting approval of a new sign design based on the new logo. The proposed signs meet the applicable sign requirements of Chapter 17.36 of the Orange Municipal Code and the Old Towne Design

Standards. The allowable signage area on the front elevation, based on the tenant's street frontage, is 41 square feet. The proposed wall sign area is 8.4 square feet. The applicant is also allowed one hanging pedestrian sign with a maximum of eight square feet per sign face, in addition to the wall signs. The proposed signs are located in logical, signable areas around the storefronts and other historic architectural features of the building. The signs will be mounted with stainless steel attachments through the mortar joints in the brick only (see Attachment 7). Both the "W" and "The Wall" script logo use material and colors that are appropriate to the building and context of the Plaza Historic District. The type face of the additional text is also compatible with the Historic District and in conformance with the Design Standards. Staff recommends that the DRC find that the proposed signage and lighting are in conformance with the Old Towne Design Standards and the *Secretary's Standards*.

Issue 2 – Awnings

The applicant previously proposed navy blue awnings. The DRC included a condition on the previously approved proposal that the awnings should be black. The applicant is proposing instead to use a blue Sunbrella fabric to match the existing awnings. The proposed awning color will be consistent across the building as a whole.

Issue 3 – Outdoor Dining Furniture

The applicant previously proposed to enclose the outdoor dining area with gray powder-coated metal planter frames on wheels with orange fiberglass planter inserts. The plant materials were a variety of succulents. At the meeting on November 18, 2015, the DRC commented on the outdoor dining furniture and recommended that the applicant consider a more simplified version of the metal planter frames and limit the use of the orange planter inserts. The DRC also recommended that the applicant use a hardier plant material, such as a type of grass, which would be better able to withstand being moved in and out of the building each day.

In response and taking into consideration the costs and feasibility of moving large planter boxes every day, the applicant is proposing to enclose the outdoor dining area with a black metal fence. The fence will be free-standing, not attached to the pavement, and supported by L-shaped brackets that face the interior of the outdoor dining area. As an alternate, the applicant is proposing to line the top of the fence with self-watering resin planters with wheat grass. The additional outdoor dining furniture includes tables, chairs, and orange umbrellas, which are shown in Attachment 4: Outdoor Dining Specifications. The proposed outdoor dining furniture is reviewed and approved by the Community Development Director under the Outdoor Dining Ordinance. Although the furniture is not part of the DRC's final determination on the project, staff is seeking the Committee's recommendation on the compatibility of the outdoor dining furniture with the Plaza Historic District.

ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

None.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND REQUIRED FINDINGS

The courts define a “Finding” as a conclusion which describes the method of analysis decision makers utilize to make the final decision. A decision making body “makes a Finding,” or draws a conclusion, through identifying evidence in the record (i.e., testimony, reports, environmental documents, etc.) and should not contain unsupported statements. The statements which support the Findings bridge the gap between the raw data and the ultimate decision, thereby showing the rational decision making process that took place. The “Findings” are, in essence, the ultimate conclusions which must be reached in order to approve (or recommend approval of) a project. The same holds true if denying a project. The decision making body must detail why it cannot make the Findings.

The Findings are applied as appropriate to each project. Based on the following Findings and statements in support of such Findings, staff recommends the DRC approve the project.

1. *In the Old Towne Historic District, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria referenced and/or recommended by the DRC or other reviewing body for the project (OMC 17.10.070.F.1).*

The proposed project conforms with the Old Towne Design Standards for the Plaza Historic District. The size, materials, and colors of the business’s logo signage and additional text meet the requirements set forth in the Design Standards and Orange Municipal Code. The stainless steel sign attachments will not negatively impact the historic brick. The proposed color scheme for the awnings matches the adjacent suites in the building and is complementary to the architectural style of the building.

2. *In any National Register Historic District, the proposed work complies with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards and Guidelines (OMC 17.10.07.F.2).*

Projects found to be in conformance with the Old Towne Design Standards are generally considered to be in conformance with the *Secretary’s Standards*. In conformance with Standard 2 and Standard 5, the proposed signage and awnings retain the character of the historic property, and alterations will not remove or negatively alter any historic materials or features of the building.

3. *The project design upholds community aesthetics through the use of an internally consistent, integrated design theme and is consistent with all adopted specific plans, applicable design standards, and their required findings (OMC 17.10.07.F.3).*

With the conditions recommended by Staff, the proposed work conforms to the prescriptive standards and design criteria set forth in the Old Towne Design Standards and Orange Municipal Code Section 17.36, as described above.

4. *For infill residential development, as specified in the City of Orange Infill Residential Design Guidelines, the new structure(s) or addition are compatible with the scale, massing,*

orientation, and articulation of the surrounding development and will preserve or enhance existing neighborhood character (OMC 17.10.07.F.4).

As the *City of Orange Infill Residential Design Guidelines* do not apply to commercial projects, this finding does not apply.

CONDITIONS

The approval of this project is subject to the following conditions:

1. All construction shall conform in substance and be maintained in general conformance with plans and exhibits labeled Attachment 7 in the staff report (date stamped received June 29, 2016), including modifications required by the conditions of approval, and as recommended for approval by the Design Review Committee.
2. The applicant agrees to indemnify, hold harmless, and defend the City, its officers, agents and employees from any and all liability or claims that may be brought against the City arising out of its approval of this permit, save and except that caused by the City's active negligence.
3. Except as otherwise provided herein, this project is approved as a precise plan. After any application has been approved, if changes are proposed regarding the location or alteration of any use or structure, a changed plan may be submitted to the Community Development Director for approval. If the Community Development Director determines that the proposed change complies with the provisions and the spirit and intent of the approval action, and that the action would have been the same for the changed plan as for the approved plot plan, the Community Development Director may approve the changed plan without requiring a new public hearing.
4. Construction permits shall be obtained for all construction work, as required by the City of Orange, Community Development Department's Building Division and Public Works Grading Division. Failure to obtain the required building permits will be cause for revocation of this permit.
5. The applicant shall obtain an encroachment permit for any work in the public right of way.
6. All structures shall comply with the requirements of Municipal Code – Chapter 15.52 (Building Security Standards), which relates to hardware, doors, windows, lighting, etc. (Ord. 7-79). Approved structural drawings shall include sections of the security code that apply. Specifications, details, or security notes may be used to convey the compliance.
7. The final approved conditions of approval shall be reprinted on the first or second page of the construction documents when submitting to the Building Department for the plan check process.
8. If not utilized, project approval expires twenty-four months from the approval date. Extensions of time may be granted in accordance with OMC Section 17.08.060. The Planning entitlements expire unless Building Permits are pulled within 2 years of the original approval.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Vicinity Map
2. Property Photographs
3. Survey Forms for 80 Plaza Square
4. Minutes from November 18, 2015 DRC meeting
5. Outdoor Dining Furniture Specifications
6. Color and Materials (to be provided at DRC meeting)
7. Plans (date stamped June 29, 2016)

cc: Dan Martinez
439 E. Chapman Avenue
Orange, CA 92866

Steven R. Smith
239 S. Glassell Street
Orange, CA 92866